

## THE D'ARCY LECTURES 2021: COMMON GOOD: Theological, Philosophical, and Political Aspects

### Lecture Five: Does Political Augustinianism Help?

#### US American Catholic controversies

Literature rejecting liberalism seems to offer a choice: theocracy or opt-out  
Separation of Church and State absolutized? Archbishop Chaput critical of John F. Kennedy

Revisit the concept pair: sacred – secular: Clarify secular as referring to a spectrum with many versions. Pope Benedict's UN speech giving one terminus – the Pope Benedict Option

**Augustine in *City of God*** Ed by D. Knowles, trans. H. Bettensen (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1972).

Emperor and Pirate: 'In the absence of justice, what is power but organized crime?'  
Definition of city and people in terms of justice: Rome was never a people, nor a city, because failed to give God what was due to God; failed in justice.

#### Contemporary versions of same challenge: A. MacIntyre, W. Cavanaugh

How respect both religion and secular rule? Mistaken to privilege one, instrumentalize other  
Theocracy views the political through lens of religion  
Civil Religion views religion through a political lens

#### Brian T. Trainor's proposals

Augustine considers a second definition: a multitude united in love of same object (distinguish love of God, love of self): City of God, vs earthly city  
Distinguish cases of *civitas terrena*, the earthly city, the secular:  
the city in history facing towards God /--/ the city in history facing away from God  
Distinguish cases of City of God  
City of God in the Parousia, in fulfilment /--/ City of God as pilgrim in history ('Church')

#### Distinguish forms of relationship: sacred – secular

**Sacred reign – secular rule:** secular rulers subject to higher standards (human rights)  
religious law incorporated in secular law, by secular authorities, for purely secular reasons  
**Sacred reign – sacred rule:** secular rules subject to religious authorities  
religious law may be incorporated in secular law by religious authorities for religious reasons

#### Compatibility with Vatican II's *Gaudium et Spes*

#### Parallel distinctions in the literature

Linda Woodhead: distinguish illiberal secularism and liberalism  
John Rawls: distinguish secularism as comprehensive doctrine, and political liberalism  
Cecile Laborde: Justificatory secularism vs comprehensive secularism. Correcting Rawls: 'the state is secular so that citizens don't have to be secular'

Michael J.S. Bruno, *Political Augustinianism* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2014)

Charles J. Chaput, OFM Cap. *Render Unto Caesar: Serving the Nation by Living our Catholic Beliefs in Political Life* (New York: Doubleday, 2008)

Brian T. Trainor, 'Augustine's Glorious City of God as Principle of the Political' in *The Heythrop Journal* 51 (2010) 543–553; 'Augustine's "Sacred Reign – Secular Rule" Conception of the State' in *The Heythrop Journal* 56 (2015) 373–387.